

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MINUTES

Thursday, April 18, 2019
4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Room 204

Commissioners Present: Jackie Barton, Clyde Henry (Chairperson), Joseph McCabe, Erin Prosser

Commissioners Absent: Dan Morgan, Steward Gibboney

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:07 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, May 9, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, May 16, 2019 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room 204 (Hearing Room)
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, March 21, 2018.
MOTION: Barton/Prosser (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
 - **Start Time for Historic Resources Commission Hearings Changed to 4:00 p.m.**
HRC hearing start time is now **permanently** changed from 6:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m.
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 19-4-5
670 Bedford Avenue
Ryan Hagen (Applicant)
MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

Old Oaks Historic District
Ernest William (Owner)



NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 19-4-6

620 East Town Street

Windsor GZE, LLC; c/o Dave Perry (Applicant)

East Town Street Historic District

Windsor GZE, LLC (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-4-6, 620 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Retain Existing Black Paint

- To avoid additional damage to the limestone, retain the existing black paint on all stone sills on the east, west, and north elevations, and the continuous stone sills/lintels on the façade.
- Retain the existing black paint on the existing metal windows and brick surrounds on all elevations.

Note: At such time when painting is required in the future, paint color should be historically appropriate to the building and historic district.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) APPROVED

3. 19-4-7

734 South Champion Avenue

Randy Youmans (Applicant/Owner)

Old Oaks Historic District

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-4-7, 734 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Doors

- Remove the existing, non-original, steel, four-panel entry door on the façade, per the submitted photo.
- Remove the existing, non-original, steel, six-panel entry door on the rear elevation, per the submitted photo.
- Install new, two-panel, fiberglass doors, to fit the existing openings.
- New doors to be ProVia Signet, Cherry Series 002-440, "Cinnamon" color, with hardware per the submitted product cut sheet and material sample.
- Install new, fixed transom windows above the new doors. Transom glass to be clear.
- New doors and transoms to be framed with 3 ½" wood trim. Trim color to be "White."
- Final details for jambs and exterior casings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Note: A fiberglass door is being approved for the front elevation as a "test case" only. The new doors are not replacing original/historic doors; Style of the original doors is not known; No historic fabric is being affected.

Front Porch Skirting

- Remove existing, unframed, diamond-pattern lattice, front porch skirting.
- Install new, framed wood, square-pattern lattice front porch skirting.
- Framing to be 2x6 wood, painted "White." Lattice to be painted "Gray" to match existing siding.

MOTION: Prosser/McCabe (4-0-0) APPROVED

4. 19-4-8

774 Bedford Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Mitchell Levine (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-4-8, 774 Bedford Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

In-Ground Pool

- Install a new, in-ground swimming pool in the rear yard, per the submitted photos, renderings, and cut sheets.
- Pool to measure 10' x 16' with a 4' surrounding concrete apron.

MOTION: Barton/McCabe (4-0-0) APPROVED

5. 19-4-9a

666 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Cassie Wilhelm & Gregory Myers (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-4-9a, 666 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Siding

- Remove the existing, cement siding on the rear elevation of the house only, to reveal original wood siding.
- Applicant is to notify and schedule a site visit with Historic Preservation Office staff upon removal of the existing cement siding, to assess the condition of original wood siding.
- If determined to be in good condition, repair/replace original siding, as needed. Paint colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- All exterior trim elements to be restored to the original profile and dimension, as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines made visible following the removal of the cement siding.
- Applicant has the option to remove the existing cement siding and restore the original siding and trim on all elevations, in consultation with Historic Preservation Office staff.
- If original wood siding on the rear elevation is highly damaged and/or deteriorated, Historic Preservation Office staff may approve installation of HardiePlank lap siding on rear elevation only. New HardiePlank lap siding to match profile and reveal of original wood siding.

MOTION: McCabe/Barton (4-0-0) APPROVED

6. 19-4-10

671 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Zachary Borchers (Applicant)

Gabriel Shelton (Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, comments were offered, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application #19-4-10, 671 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, for installation of a new retaining wall, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the May 16, 2019 Historic Resources Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Prosser:

- The original slope along Wilson Avenue, up and down the street, is pretty well intact, so making this kind of alteration would be a significant change in character to Wilson Avenue, which would be detrimental.
- Would not be supportive of a retaining wall at this location.

Commissioner McCabe:

- In unique circumstances, where grading is severe or eroding might be present, that may be one consideration for a unique scenario calling for a wall, but those conditions don't appear to exist at this site. Would have reservations about supporting a retaining wall here.

Commissioner Henry:

- Referred to one case where the City made changes to the street/sidewalk and dramatically cut into the yard, in which case a new retaining wall was then needed.

Commissioner Barton:

- The gently sloping yard in front of these homes is part of the landscape character of the homes and the street.
- Cited City Code 3116.13/Standards for Site Improvements.
- Thinks any wall would not be compatible to adjacent contributing properties and open spaces. Can't foresee a situation where any retaining wall could be supported here.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) CONTINUED

7. 19-4-11

715 South Ohio Avenue

William Hernandez/Eagle Home Services, Inc. (Applicant)

Old Oaks Historic District

Eagle Home Services, Inc. (Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 19-4-11, 715 South Ohio Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Build New Garage

- Remove the existing concrete garage/parking pad complete.
- Build new, frame, 20' x 20', two-car garage on concrete slab, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Roof to have 4/12 pitch with shingles from the Approved Roofing Shingles List.
- Exterior cladding to be smooth, horizontal, vinyl siding.
- Wood corner boards and trim around pedestrian door to be 1x4; wood trim around overhead door to be 1x5 above door and 1x4 on sides.
- Fascia to be 1x6 with wood soffit.
- Single overhead garage door to have the appearance of double carriage doors.
- Setback of garage not to be more than ten feet (10') from east side of alley.
- Any/all exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Cut sheets for pedestrian door and overhead door to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Revised site plan to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF APPROVALS

• 19-4-1

2300-2302 North High Street

Northwood Park Historic District

Kohr Royer Griffith, Inc. / agent for Miners Castle LLC (Applicant)

Miners Castle LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 19-4-1, 2300-2302 North High Street, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Tree Removal

- To avoid further damage to the retaining wall, remove one (1) tree on the south side of the house between the sidewalk and retaining wall.
- Remove the one (1) tree in the rear yard that was struck by lightning.

- Removal to be done in accordance with standard industry practices to insure the safety of all neighboring properties.
- Remove the stumps below grade to prevent new growth, and haul away all debris.
- A new tree is to be planted within the same general area as the tree that has been removed in the rear yard only.
- The species of the new tree to be chosen by Applicant.
- Applicant/Owner is to submit the choice of tree species to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Repair/Replace Collapsed Retaining Wall

- Remove all collapsed and damage concrete block retaining wall debris along the sidewalk on the south side of the property.
- Build a new, concrete block retaining wall in the same location, like-for-like.
- Existing stone retaining wall along the front/west side of the property to remain, as is.

Note: Concrete block wall has been in place since before Northwood Park Historic District was established.

• **19-4-2**

1063 Bryden Road

Liberty Restoration, LLC. (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Brian M. White (Owner)

Approve Application 19-4-2, 1063 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, porches, and dormers, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[] GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **19-4-3**

1330 Bryden Road

Gerhard Gnosa (Applicant/Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

Approve Application 19-4-3, 1330 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Tile Roofs / Dormers

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated tiles on the roofs of the two (2) front-facing dormers, per the submitted photographs.
- New or used tiles to match the color and profile of existing tiles.

Install Original Windows / Dormers

- Remove existing, non-original glass in the windows of the arched, wall dormer. Reinstall the original stained glass in the existing openings.
- Reinstall original window in the gabled dormer at the center of the main roof.

• **19-4-4**

5055 Dierker Road

Joseph Henderson House/Individual Listing

John Chess (Applicant)

John Chess & Keith Dailey (Owner)

Approve Application 19-4-4, 5055 Dierker Road, Joseph Henderson House/Individual Listing, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting Barn & House

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the barn and house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be: Barn – SW7588 “Show Stopper”; House/frame additions only - SW7006 “Extra White.”
- Wood trim and shutters on original brick section of house not being painted at this time.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., exterior brick walls; stone foundation and water table; stone window and door sills/lintels) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **19-4-9b**

666 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Cassie Wilhelm & Gregory Myers (Applicant/Owner)

Application #19-4-9 has been divided into item ‘a’ for German Village Commission review under Staff Recommendations (see above), and item ‘b’ for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application 19-4-9b, 666 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing chain-link fence located in the front and rear yard.
- Install a new six-foot high (6' H), wood privacy fence on, or within, the north, south, and east property lines in the rear yard.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **19-4-5**

670 Bedford Avenue

Ryan Hagen (Applicant)

Old Oaks Historic District

Ernest William (Owner)

Approve Application 19-4-5, 670 Bedford Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Temporary Accessibility Ramp

- Install a temporary ramp in the rear yard, extending from the existing rear deck to the existing parking area, per the submitted photos.
- Modular aluminum ramp to be per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Ramp to be provided by and removed through the Veterans' Administration.
- Applicant is to notify Historic Preservation Office staff upon removal of the temporary ramp.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURN